

FM REVIEW 2017 31 COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO EDITOR: This essay describes the author's participation in the national Women's March shortly after Trump was elected. The writing is okay, and the politics are passionate. The essay raises interesting questions about the role of physician activism, which are certainly worth exploring. I thought the final sentence about future generations walking in a circle was particularly well-turned and provocative.

The problem for me is that, as written, the essay is less a story, a narrative, than a thinly veiled opinion piece. That all the opinions align with mine is lovely, but I'm concerned about the journal becoming a forum for political holding forth, which does not seem appropriate.

If the decision is to revise, rather than talk about choice, immigration, and climate change in the abstract, the author might provide a particular patient anecdote that illustrates her concern. It would be tricky to do so, however, within the 1000 word limit.

Finally, although I was intrigued by the issue of physician activism, this is only obliquely addressed in the essay. We do not even discover the narrator is a physician till the bottom of the first page. The essay would be stronger if it reflected more deeply on why she decided to join the March, what she learned as a physician (and mother) that might affect the way she practices medicine, teaches residents, or takes actions in the future.

COMMENTS TO AUTHOR: I appreciated reading this essay about your thoughts as you participated in the Women's March. Your politics align closely with my own, and your well-turned concluding sentence conveys my fears for the future as well.

The primary difficulty I had with the essay is that it is basically a recital of your personal political views rather than telling a story. To improve the piece, you might consider sharing particular patient stories about choice, immigration, and climate change, rather than simply presenting your convictions.

My other concern is that, for a readership of family physicians and medical educators, there is very little in the essay about how this experience affected you as a physician, perhaps influencing the way you practice medicine or teach residents or advocate within your professional organizations. I would have liked to better understand the connection between you as a marcher and you as a doctor.

Despite these reservations, it was uplifting to read your account and I hope you continue to act on your deeply held beliefs.